

ANALYSIS OF RIVER ENGINEERING SEMINAR, BIRNAM 9th NOVEMBER 2005

Q Was the venue format convenient?

Base	64 100.0%
Missing	
No reply	- -
Was the venue format convenient?	
Yes	63 98.4%
No	1 1.6%

- 2 Very good
- 7 Good area to go to
- 22 More modern microphony is required ie microphone attached to speaker
- 23 Earlier start to suit trains from Glasgow and Edinburgh/or later and finish to suit train times.
- 33 Excellent venue/catering
- 34 Easy to find. Roomy.
- 35 Very good
- 36 Too cramped in places inc lunch and gents wc
- 38 Fantastic venue
- 43 Excellent
- 45 Long way from Ferry/Airport
- 48 Lack of parking areas a disadvantage
- 54 Excellent
- 61 Very central
- 64 Yes, all the facilities were good

Q Did the seminar live up to its promise?

Base	64 100.0%
Missing	
No reply	1 1.6%
Did the seminar live up to its promise?	
Yes	62 96.9%
No	1 1.6%

- 5 I should have liked some more detailed expertise regarding river management. What I heard was fine as far as it went.
- 6 Probably more direct reference to effect of regs on fishings.
- 8 Case study approach was particularly useful
- 12 As a roads person, most of work carried out is done as economically as possible. The course highlighted the need for wider thinking.
- 13 Would have liked more information on best practice for road crossings.
- 14 Very interesting
- 18 Excellent range of presentations. Representing all interest groups
- 22 Possibly of more general use if it had been held after SEPA had got some of its act together.
- 23 Speakers and Chairman - Good choice.
- 29 Needed more on practical solutions. eg non passable culverts and small scale fish passes.
- 33 Insufficient depth of detail ie too basic on what is required
- 34 Good speakers, visuals and buffet
- 38 Very useful for update on WFD and CAR progress
- 47 Very interesting. Useful summaries on CAR and potential affects of risk assessment.
- 51 Thought the seminar would be more geared to fish eg - designs for ensuring fish migration etc and preparing for the new regulations.
- 53 Good mix of stakeholders
- 54 Good networking
- 58 Discussion led predominantly by fishery interests. Engineers are 'small fry', this was a function of make up of delegates.
- 61 Good presentations. Greater SEPA presence would have been welcomed.
- 64 Very useful to all concerned

Q Could we have improved it?

Base	64 100.0%
Missing	
No reply	12 18.8%
Could we have improved it?	
Yes	17 26.6%
No	35 54.7%

- 5 See Q5
- 6 SEPA rep knew what the subject entailed but hard to hear and follow.
- 13 It was good but interested in reducing the effect of roads on watercourses - not just fish.
- 15 Possibly but not sure how.
- 17 A larger section on new technologies with regards to road construction/mitigation
- 19 Excellent mix of fish and non-fish groups gave rounded day.
- 22 The primary subject was CARS. More SEPA (and a broader SEPA) contribution would have been beneficial.
- 24 More lunch
- 29 see above
- 33 Better briefing for presenters to match talk title with presentation.
- 34 Always room for improvement. Very comprehensive.
- 42 Maybe someone who could have given an authoritative presentation on good practice - say Chris Soulsby - could have been invited to give a presentation on this.
- 46 It might have been useful to invite contractors to this as well.
- 47 A couple of sheets of lined paper included in pack.
- 49 Clearer focus perhaps on the topic of rivers
- 55 Present examples of good practice rather than focusing on bad.
- 56 Copies of presentation to retain would be useful
- 58 See above. Target delegates. May be that engineers are more reticent
- 60 Happy with the balance of presentations and subsequent discussion.
- 61 More focus on engineering.
- 62 Should also have water and tea available as well as coffee.
- 63 Very good selection of speakers

Q Are you interested in attending future Seminars?

Base	64 100.0%
Missing	
No reply	- -
Are you interested in attending future seminars on the su...	
Yes	64 100.0%
No	- -

- 6 Future meetings on CAR etc.
- 7 As long as localised area.
- 8 Future experiences of CAR and fisheries will be invaluable (case studies are particularly useful)
- 14 Freshwater, ecological, conservation and biodiversity topics
- 22 Could be held once SEPA has "trained" its staff. This would forewarn us what SEPA limitations would be in the future.
- 34 Updates, workshops, related subjects.
- 38 When appropriate
- 48 Preferably after the regulations have been in force.
- 53 Partnership experience of catchment management
- 56 Particularly in the application of the regulations after they have been in force for say 12 months
- 60 As this is such a new piece of legislation - important to share experience
- 64 I think another meeting on the same topic in 12-18 months would be valuable

Q If anyone else in your Local Authority or organisation might be interested in future seminars please give details.

- 6 Dr David Parratt, 91 Strathern Road, West Ferry, Dundee
- 7 Local Councils, and Forestry Commission
- 16 Local SNH
- 17 Perhaps contact someone to attend from Dumfries and Galloway Council.
- 19 Adrian Hudson, River Dee Trust, ahudson@ddsfb.co.uk
- 24 For distribution across FWAG Scotland please send to deborah.roberts@fwag.org.uk
- 32 Jonathan Hall, Head of Rural Policy (policy@srpba.com)
- 40 Iain Mackinnen
- 43 Environment Manager, Strategic Planning, County Buildings, Linlithgow, EH49 7EZ
- 45 SEPA Stornoway Office
- 49 All attended
- 56 As long as one of us is notified we will circulate the notification around our people
- 60 Most areas are covered by current attendees
- 64 Alex A Lyle, ALP, 18 John Knox Road, Longniddry, E Lothian

Q Are there any other subjects you would like us to consider?

Base	64 100.0%
Missing	
No reply	23 35.9%
Are there any other subjects you would like us to consider?	
Yes	29 45.3%
No	12 18.8%

- 4 Floodplain management
- 5 Some more detailed river management case studies would be welcome.
- 6 Follow up on Regulations and other related topics.
- 8 Contractor experiences and involvement in process
- 11 Catchment management development and implementation of plans.
- 14 Can't think of any just now
- 19 Monitoring water quality and building works for Bailiffs and Biologists
- 22 Some geomorphological input or some input who would have us believe they are qualified independent experts on River engineering! This would provide for very lively debates!
- 23 Practical design of fish passes. Impact of flood prevention works and bridge works. What about riverside mammals?
- 24 Riparian Zone management
- 27 Sustainable flood management - maintenance and management of watercourses.
- 28 Emergency procedures ie fast tracking applications and control.
- 29 Effects of construction (noise, pollution, vibration etc)
- 30 Water industry ??? Water abstraction
- 32 Any subject areas relevant to land managers
- 33 Actual case studies on the practicalities of flood alleviation scheme
- 35 Similar event for 2006
- 39 Biodiversity Engineering and Species Licensing.
- 40 Soft engineering techniques, possible existing Scottish examples. Angling view of river works.
- 43 River restoration. Soft engineering and remediation. Integrating biodiversity with amenity landscape management.
- 45 Tools of best practice ie practical ways of reducing construction/engineering impacts on water.
- 47 Other topic for LBAP could be implications of Nature Conservation Act (Scotland) 2004
- 49 More general habitat creation topics
- 50 Follow up on CAR reguls in use (1 year on)
- 51 WFD and monitoring future
- 53 Post CAP incentives for sustainable flood management
- 54 Sea trout
- 55 Discuss practical solutions to alternative methods of culverting and research potential suppliers of approved materials.
- 60 Integrating various Directives - WFD/Habitats etc - issues forcing individuals - organisations.
- 63 Ecology and Morphology interactions
- 64 Progress on LBAPs

Q Other Comments

- 2 Repeat the meeting in due course.
- 5 It was rather cold in the conference hall.
- 6 Useful seminar
- 8 Similar seminar on discharges of domestic agricultural and industrial processes re WFD and fisheries would be interesting. Follow up seminars - YES PLEASE!!
- 9 Talks were good length as was day in general.
- 14 Food ran out at lunch time. Perhaps suggest venue provide smaller plates so those at front of queue take less so those at end of queue get some food. Also couldn't find any tea, only coffee
- 15 Catering - 2 potatoes and a lettuce leaf do not constitute a lunch. If you provide a buffet it has to be properly managed. A second meeting in 18 months or so would be useful.
- 17 Very good seminar - interesting and topical.
- 21 Follow up meeting would be useful
- 22 Well worthwhile. Thank you for your organisation.
- 23 Catering: vegetarian foods should be clearly marked and available
- 27 Interaction with other legislation. Flood Prevention (Scot) Act 1961 as amended. Roads (Scot) Act 1984. Follow up meeting required.
- 28 a follow up meeting to gauge progress would be a good idea.
- 29 More speakers esp more road engineers.
- 32 Excellent day. Very useful and worthwhile. Future similar meeting would be useful.
- 33 Pitlochry flood scheme - gave evidence of hard engineering/old fashioned culvert use - not a good example of best practice.
- 34 Keep up the good work pushing the environmental cause forward.
- 41 Useful day. Thank you.
- 43 An excellent day. A follow up meeting might be useful
- 44 Although retired from Fisheries Research/Consultancy, I found the seminar interesting and informative
- 46 Well run, I particularly enjoyed Ian McMyre's presentation - great illustrations.
- 49 Follow up meeting in 12 months after Oct 06 after transition period.
- 52 Follow up would be good.
- 55 A follow up/consolidation meeting in 12-18 months would be of great benefit to see where we are now.
- 58 Further discussion in the future when CAR is operating fully would be of interest.
- 61 On the whole a well structured day with diverse selection of speakers.

62 have a similar seminar in 2 years, once the CAR legislation has had time to 'bed-in'
63 Thanks for making space for me at the last minute. Sorry I had to leave before the discussion.
64 I enjoyed the meeting